**Special Review of** 

#### Temporary Staffing Costs in School Food Service For July 2015 through June 2019

November 22, 2019

Report #2019-15



#### MISSION STATEMENT

The School Board of Palm Beach County is committed to providing a world class education with excellence and equity to empower each student to reach his or her highest potential with the most effective staff to foster the knowledge, skills, and ethics required for responsible citizenship and productive careers.

> Donald E. Fennoy II, Ed.D. Superintendent of Schools

#### **School Board Members**

Frank A. Barbieri, Jr., Esq., Chair Chuck Shaw, Vice Chair Marcia Andrews Karen M. Brill Barbara McQuinn Debra L. Robinson, M.D. Erica Whitfield

#### **Audit Committee Members**

David H. Talley, Chair Tammy McDonald Anderson, Vice Chair N. Ronald Bennett, CPA Michael Dixon, CPA/PFS Deborah Manzo Kathleen Weigel, Ed.D. Chandler Williamson

#### Audit Committee Representatives

Frank A. Barbieri, Jr., Esq., School Board Chair Donald E. Fennoy II, Ed.D., Superintendent of Schools Mike Burke, Chief Financial Officer JulieAnn Rico, Esq., General Counsel Maria Lloyd, Principal Representative Justin Katz, CTA President

### **Special Review of**

## Temporary Staffing Costs in School Food Service For July 2015 through June 2019

#### **Table of Contents**

	Page
Executive Summary	i
Purpose and Authority	1
Scope and Methodology	1
Background	2
Cost Analysis	4
The Need To Comply With Florida's Jessica Lunsford Act	6
Other Determining Variables: Temporary Employees From the District Versus Those From Outside Placement Agencies	7
FSAs Staffing At Broward And Miami-Dade School Districts	8
Conclusion	8
Appendix – Management's Responses	
<ul><li>A. School Food Service</li><li>B. Office of the CFO</li></ul>	10 11

This page intentionally left blank.

#### **Special Review of**

#### Temporary Staffing Costs in School Food Service For July 2015 through June 2019

#### **EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

Pursuant to the *Office of Inspector General's 2018-19 Work Plan*, we have reviewed the temporary staffing costs in School Food Service for July 2015 through June 2019. Temporary employees for Food Service could come from outside placement agencies or the District's own Temp Pool. The primary objective of this review was to analyze the cost and other non-monetary consequences for both options.

**Budgeted Positions and Vacancies**. As of June 30, 2019, the District budgeted a total of 1,342 Food Service Assistant (FSA) positions, of which 305 (23%) were vacant. The School Food Service Department (Department) was working continuously to fill these vacant positions. Dayto-day vacancies vary depending on the extent of absenteeism in the workforce. The Department has initiated a two-phase program to establish an in-house pool of trained per diem workers who can be substitutes for absent FSAs. This in-house pool program is expected to be completed by June 30, 2021.

<u>Actual Personnel Expenses for Temp FSA</u>. The District expended \$822,079, \$1,419,275, \$1,477,462, and \$1,341,454, for in-house Temp FSA during Fiscal Years 2016, 2017, 2018, and 2019 respectively; and expended \$3,511,858, \$3,002,162, \$2,520,482, and \$2,609,380 respectively for outside placement Temp FSA during the same time period.

<u>Cost Analysis for 305 Temp FSAs</u>. Based on the need to fill the 305 vacant FSA positions, the OIG performed a cost analysis comparing the costs for in-house temp staff (option 1) to the costs for temp staff from an outside placement agency (option 2).

Based on the FY19 average in-house hourly rates, the annual cost for providing FSAs from the in-house Temp Pool would cost the District \$4,029,660 per year. The same staffing levels acquired through the outside contracted placement agencies would cost the District between \$3,630,415 and \$3,721,610. As a result, the estimated annual cost for using in-house temp staff would be \$308,050 (8%) to \$399,245 (11%) higher than those from the outside placement agencies.

**The Need To Comply With Florida's Jessica Lunsford Act**. To comply with Florida's *Jessica Lunsford Act*, all Temp FSAs from the outside placement agency are required to complete the background clearance by School Police. To determine if all outside temps' background checks have been properly cleared, the OIG requested from the Department and the vendor the lists of outside temps who worked at the schools during Fiscal Year 2018. The verification process noted significant discrepancies between the list provided by the Department and the list provided by the vendor. Specifically, the Department's list contained 1,297 workers, while the list from the vendor contained 344 workers. The OIG compared the two lists and requested School Police to verify the background check records for 251 temporary workers that appeared on both lists. The verification

results revealed that one worker had not been fingerprinted, and two other workers' fingerprinting and background checks were expired when they were assigned to work at the schools.

Other Determining Variables: Temporary Employees From the District Versus Those From Outside Placement Agencies. There are other non-monetary factors for comparing District's temporary employees to outside placement agencies to fill the need for substitute cafeteria workers. The following schedule shows some of the differences for each scenario:

I	Determining Variables	<u>Option 1</u> Using District Temporary Employee	<u>Option 2</u> Using Outside Placement Agency Temporary Worker
1.	Operating Costs	More expensive due to higher hourly rates plus fringe benefits. Estimated \$4.0 million per year;	Less expensive due to lower hourly rates.
		i.e. 8% to 11% higher than outside placement agency staff.	Estimated \$3.6 million to \$3.7 million per year.
2.	Workforce Readily Available	Stable, better control for employee absenteeism.	May not meet the District's need.
3.	Technical/Skill Training to ensure Food Safety	Assurance of quality and experience of employees.	The District has to provide training for inexperienced outside workers – additional costs to the District.
4.	Compliance with <i>Jessica</i> <i>Lunsford Act</i> (Student Safety/Worker's Background Checks)	Assurance of employee background and clearance checks.	No guarantee.
5.	Recruitment, Administration and Training Costs	Administrative costs for recruitment and maintaining sufficient work force.	Administrative costs absorbed by outside agency.

**Conclusion**. Our cost analysis for filling the 305 vacant FSA positions concluded that the estimated annual cost for using outside Temp FSAs was between \$3,630,415 and \$3,721,610; and the cost for using in-house Temp FSAs was \$4,029,660. As a result, using outside temp would cost \$308,050 (8%) to \$399,245 (11%) less than the in-house temp.

However, there are other non-monetary variables for both options in addition to the cost consequence. The Food Service Department should consider these implications as well as their overall objectives and priorities in providing food services to our students and District employees. These determining variables include the workforce availability, technical skill and food safety training, workers' background checks, and the related administrative costs. The Department has to determine the optimal combination of staffing provided by temporary employees in meeting the ultimate goal.

#### Management's Response:

School Food Service: We agree with the content of the review and recommendation provided.

- (1) We have implemented the following corrective action: When a temporary services employee arrives at a school for the first time, the School Food Service Manager photo copies their badge and files it in a folder in their office. This ensures that each staff member has been verified that they have a valid District ID. Additionally, annually the School Food Service Field Specialists audit the school and the folder is checked to ensure procedures are being followed. We will be implementing a process (most likely through electronic tracking) that will also track expiration dates of staff badges and will alert us and the Temporary Services agency when the expiration date is getting close.
- (2) School Food Service will continue to evaluate non-monetary and monetary factors when determining the use of temporary services.

(Please see page 10.)

**Office of the CFO:** The School Food Service (SFS) department has historically done an excellent job managing their resources. The School District of Palm Beach County is fortunate the SFS operation is self-sufficient and requires no supplemental funding from the General Fund budget. The SFS department leadership is best equipped to make staffing decisions required to fulfill their mission and serve over 34.5 million meals each school year.

(Please see page 11.)

This page intentionally left blank.



THE SCHOOL DISTRICT OF PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA

OFFICE OF INSPECTOR GENERAL 3318 FOREST HILL BLVD., C-306 WEST PALM BEACH, FL 33406

(561) 434-7335 FAX: (561) 434-8652 www.palmbeachschools.org Hotline: (855) 561-1010

# **MEMORANDUM**

LUNG CHIU, CIG, CPA INSPECTOR GENERAL SCHOOL BOARD FRANK A. BARBIERI, JR., ESQ., CHAIRMAN CHUCK SHAW, VICE CHAIRMAN MARCIA ANDREWS KAREN M. BRILL BARBARA MCQUINN DEBRA L. ROBINSON, M.D. ERICA WHITFIELD

DONALD E. FENNOY II, Ed.D., SUPERINTENDENT

- TO: Honorable Chair and Members of the School Board Donald E. Fennoy II, Ed. D., Superintendent Chair and Members of the Audit Committee
  FROM: Lung Chiu, CPA, Inspector General
- DATE: November 22, 2019
- SUBJECT: Special Review of Temporary Staffing Costs in School Food Service For July 2015 through June 2019

#### PURPOSE AND AUTHORITY

Pursuant to the *Office of Inspector General's 2018-19 Work Plan*, we have reviewed the temporary staffing costs in School Food Service for July 2015 through June 2019. Temporary employees for Food Service could come from outside placement agencies or the District's own Temp Pool. The primary objective of this review was to analyze the cost and other non-monetary consequences for both options.

#### SCOPE AND METHODOLOGY

We compared the estimated costs of (1) procuring temporary employees from outside personnel placement agencies to (2) the School District's in-house Temp Pool employees. We interviewed related District staff and reviewed the following documents and relevant information for our analysis:

- School Board Policy 6.185 School Food Service Management Policy
- Term Contract 15C-001A Contract Between The School Board of Palm Beach County, Florida and A & Associates, Inc. (Contract)
- Bid Tabulation for Term Contract 15C-001A Temporary Personnel Staffing Services
- Bid Tabulation for Term Contract 19C-036A Temporary Personnel Staffing Services
- School Food Service Department time keeping records for placement agency staff
- Invoices submitted by placement agency
- District payroll expense records

The draft report was sent to management for review and comments. Management responses are included in the Appendix. We appreciate the courtesy and cooperation extended to us by staff during the review. The final draft report was presented to the Audit Committee at its November 22, 2019, Meeting.

#### BACKGROUND

During Fiscal Year 2019, the District sponsored Federally funded Child Nutrition Programs in 172 District schools and 34 charter schools through District school cafeterias. Cafeteria services were also provided in the Fulton-Holland Educational Services Center. Each cafeteria is staffed with Food Service Assistants (FSAs) and supervised by a Food Service Manager. The number of FSAs required for each cafeteria is determined by the number of meals needed per day based on the *Meals Per Labor Hour*<sup>(1)</sup> calculation.

<u>Budgeted Positions and Vacancies</u>. As of June 30, 2019, the District budgeted 1,342 FSA positions, of which 305 (23%) were vacant. The School Food Service Department (Department) was working continuously to fill these vacant positions. Day-to-day vacancies at the schools vary depending on the extent of absenteeism in the workforce. The Department has begun exploring the option of establishing an in-house Temp Pool of FSAs to fill the daily vacancies. In the interim, the Department continues to utilize temporary personnel from an outside personnel placement agency to meet the staffing needs.

<u>Classification of District's FSAs</u>. FSAs are hired to work from four to eight hours per day (20 to 40 hours per week) depending on the needs of the site's operation (such as serving times of breakfast and lunch, and special needs of other programs, i.e. snacks for Afterschool Program, or supper). Most FSAs are part-time workers and are classified as either regular District employees or temporary employees. Regular employees are eligible for fringe benefits such as retirement, health and life insurance, and leave time.

Typically, a FSA is hired as a temporary employee and evaluated within 90 days of employment. Once the temporary employee has been with one manager in a permanent position for 30 days, a decision is to be made to either (1) convert the temporary employee into a regular employee at that location, (2) transfer the employee to another location, or (3) terminate the temporary employee. Because of this evaluation and conversion process, it is uncommon for a FSA to remain as a temporary employee for longer than six months.

There are two categories of temporary employees: in-system and out-of-system. A temporary insystem employee may be eligible for insurance and retirement benefits depending on when the employee was hired and the number of hours worked per day. Temporary in-system employees could hold more than one job within the District. For example, a FSA might also hold a position in the Afterschool Program. Out-of-system temporary employees can only have one part-time job with the District, do not accrue leave time, and are paid only for the hours they worked.

<u>Non-Monetary Determining Factors of Both Options</u>. One option the Department would like to pursue is to reduce the reliance on external placement agencies in providing temporary workers because sometimes it can be difficult to:

- (1) Obtain the needed qualified workers with the required skill-set to fill the vacancies, and
- (2) Verify if the temporary workers from placement agency have completed the proper background clearance.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>(1)</sup> The Meals Per Labor Hour factor is the most common measure of productivity in school nutrition program. It is computed by dividing the number of meal equivalents prepared per day by the number of labor hours per day.

<u>Recruitment Strategy</u>. To address the above concerns, the Department has initiated a two-phase recruitment program.

<u>Phase I</u>. This phase has been in practice since FY18. The Department will continue recruiting part-time employees to staff cafeterias through various avenues, such as county-wide job fairs, banners at schools, District's automated phone system, and advertisements, etc. District employees who work four to five hours per day (or 20 to 25 hours per week) are not eligible for District fringe benefits. Employee recruitment is an ongoing effort by the Department; however, School Food Service expects to be staffed to a level where Phase 2 will be possible to begin by June 30, 2020.

<u>Phase II</u>. This phase is expected to begin in the summer of 2020, and will be completed by June 30, 2021. Based on information from the *Leave of Absence Forms* from District employees, the Department will assess and determine the need for temporary workers in all school cafeterias. The Department will evaluate the needs by region and day-of-the-week to determine the number of temporary workers needed and be assigned to a base school, with the guaranteed minimum number of workhours per week. These workers can also be used to fill-in for FSA workers needed at other locations.

Table 1 shows the total actual salary and benefit expenses for Food Service Assistants for Fiscal Years 2016, 2017, 2018, and 2019 in the District.

Food Service Assistants	FY 2016	FY 2017	FY 2018	FY 2019
(FSA)	Salary & Benefits	Salary & Benefits	Salary & Benefits	Salary & Benefits
Regular (Full Time)		· •		
FSA I	\$18,895,384	\$20,419,972	\$22,741,202	\$23,945,878
FSA II	1,096,958	1,011,353	988,926	984,107
Total	\$19,992,342	\$21,431,325	\$23,730,128	\$24,929,986
Temp FSAs				
FSA I	\$771,422	\$1,372,960	\$1,442,568	\$1,305,448
FSA II	50,657	46,315	34,894	36,005
Total	\$822,079	\$1,419,275	\$1,477,462	\$1,341,453
Total FSA Expense	\$20,814,421	\$22,850,600	\$25,207,590	\$26,271,439
Total # of Meals Served	31,851,105	32,990,251	33,357,174	34,460,513

Table 1District's Food Service Assistants Personnel Expenses

Sources: PeopleSoft System, Fringe Benefit Rate Schedules for FY 2016, 2017, 2018, & 2019 and Food Service Department.
Note: The majority of the Temp employees are not actual additional employee counts. These are placeholders for the Regular (Full Time) employees who also work during the summer. PeopleSoft requires a 2<sup>nd</sup> job screen to be opened with a budgeted position even though this does not represent an additional staff member.

<u>Outside Placement Agencies</u>. During Fiscal Years 2016 through 2019, School Food Service used a bid (*RFP #15C-001A*) awarded vendor, A & Associates, Inc. (Agency), to provide temporary employees for cafeterias for absent FSAs or vacant positions. The District is billed for hours worked by the temporary FSAs.

Table 2 shows the annual payments to A & Associates, Inc. for its FSAs provided to the District during Fiscal Years 2016 through 2019.

	FY 2016	FY 2017	FY 2018	FY 2019
Payments for Outside FSAs <sup>(1)</sup>	\$3,511,858	\$3,002,162	\$2,520,482	\$2,609,380
Average # of Outside FSAs per Day <sup>(2)</sup>	306	258	214	140

Table 2
Payments to A & Associates, Inc. for Outside FSAs

Sources: (1) District Accounts Payable System (2) School Food Service Manager Records

On June 19, 2019, the District awarded the contract (*RFP #19C-036A*) for temporary FSAs to two vendors effective July 1, 2019 through June 30, 2021: (1) 22<sup>nd</sup> Century Technologies, Inc. as the primary vendor, and (2) Spur Employment, Inc. as the secondary vendor.

#### COST ANALYSIS

<u>District's Salary Ranges for FSAs</u>. During Fiscal Years 2018 and 2019, the hourly rate for inhouse FSA I approved by the School Board ranged from \$11.47/hour to \$22.08/hour, and \$12.54/hour to \$23.77/hour for FSA II. According to Food Service, all newly hired FSAs will start at the beginning hourly rate of \$11.47. Based on the FY19 payroll records, the average hourly rates (before fringe benefits) for in-house Temp FSA employees was \$11.94.

<u>Billing Hourly Rates for FSA Provided by Outside Placement Agencies</u>. Effective July 1, 2019, the billing hourly rates for FSA provided by the two bid awarded vendors (through *RFP* #19C-036A) are as follow:

- Primary vendor (22<sup>nd</sup> Century Technologies, Inc.): \$12.73 / hour
- Secondary vendor (Spur Employment, Inc.): \$13.05 / hour

<u>Annual Cost for Temporary FSAs</u>. Table 3 shows the average hourly rates and annual costs for in-house and outside temporary FSAs. These calculations are based on 5 hours/day, and 187 workdays/year.

FSAs	Hourly Wages		Annual Cost Per FSA <sup>(a)</sup>	
FSAS	Minimum	Maximum	Minimum	Maximum
In-House Temp FSA	FY19 Average = \$11.94		FY19 Average = \$13,212 <sup>(b)</sup>	
Outside Temp FSA (Placement Agencies)	\$12.73 (Primary Vendor)	\$13.05 (Secondary Vendor)	\$11,903 (Primary Vendor)	\$12,202 (Secondary Vendor)

# Table 3Annual Cost Per FSA

Notes: (a) Based on 5 Hours/Day, 187 Days/Year work schedule.

(b) Includes the Fringe Benefits (Florida Retirement System, Social Security and Medicare Taxes, and Workers' Compensation Insurance) for part-time employee working less than six hours per day.

<u>The District Had 305 Vacant FSA Positions as of June 30, 2019</u>. As of June 30, 2019, the District budgeted 1,342 FSA positions, of which 305 (23%) were vacant. There are two options to fill the daily staffing needs: (1) to fill the vacant positions with in-house pool of temporary employees, and (2) continue to use the external placement agency. Part-time FSAs would not be eligible for benefits because of the reduced work hours (i.e. 20 to 25 hours per week), but the employment taxes must be included in cost analysis<sup>(2)</sup>. A temporary FSA hired through an outside placement agency has fixed hourly rates per contract.

<u>Option 1: Use of In-House Temp (all vacancies are filled with District employees)</u>. Based on the FY19 average hourly rate for in-hours Temp FSAs, the annual cost of providing the needed substitutes from the in-house Temp Pool would cost the District an estimated \$4,029,660 per year.

<u>Option 2: Use of Temp from Outside Placement Agency</u>. Based on the contract hourly rates, the same staffing level provided by the outside placement agency would cost the District between \$3,630,415 and \$3,721,610, depending on which vendor the temporary workers are coming from.

<u>Annual Staffing Costs Comparison</u>. Table 4 shows the annual personnel costs for Option 1 and Option 2. The estimated cost for filling the 305 vacant FSA positions with outside Temp FSAs would cost between \$3,630,415 and \$3,721,610; and the estimated cost for in-house Temp was \$4,029,660, or \$308,050 (8%) to \$399,245 (11%) higher than the outside Temp.

 $<sup>^{(2)}</sup>$  For Fiscal Year 2019, the Fringe Benefit Rate for a part-time employee working less than six hours per day is 18.35%.

Table 4
<b>Ranges of Annual Personnel Costs *</b>
For In-House and Outside Temporary Workers

Number of Vacancies	<u>Option 1</u> In-House Temp		ion <u>2</u> acement Agencies)
(As of June 30, 2019)	Average Annual Cost	Minimum Annual Cost	Maximum Annual Cost
	(\$13,212)	(\$11,903)	(\$12,202)
305 Vacancies	\$4,029,660	\$3,630,415	\$3,721,610

\* Annual costs based on 5 workhours/day, 187 workdays/year.

#### THE NEED TO COMPLY WITH FLORIDA'S JESSICA LUNSFORD ACT

To comply with Florida's *Jessica Lunsford Act*, *Section IX* of the *June 18, 2015, Contact*, A & Associate, Inc., is required to complete the Level 2 Florida Department of Law Enforcement Background Check and FBI screening for all its FSAs, including fingerprinting by the District's Police Department. Once cleared, the placement agency's employees are provided with School District vendor badges in order to access District facilities. This review also disclosed (1) staffing records maintained by Food Service were inconsistent with A & Associate's, and (2) four A & Associate staff were not properly fingerprinted prior working at District cafeterias.

Inconsistent Staffing Records Maintained by Food Service and the Placement Agency (Vendor). OIG obtained from the Department and A & Associate the lists of outside Temp assigned to District school cafeterias during Fiscal Year 2018. The list from the Department contained 1,297 workers, but the list provided by A & Associate contained only 344 workers.

OIG compared the two lists and found that only 251 names appeared on both lists. As result, 1,046 (1,297 - 251) temporary workers from the vendor that were paid by the District during Fiscal Year 2018 were not on the vendor's list; while the Department has no billing records for 93 (344 - 251) billed workers.

Due to the significant discrepancies in employee records provided by A & Associate and the Department, the OIG was unable to determine if background checks for all the temporary workers from A & Associate had been cleared before they were allowed to access District facility during Fiscal Year 2018.

<u>Verification of Status of Background Checks</u>. Since a complete and accurate list of all temporary workers was not available for our review, the OIG requested School Police to verify the background check records for the 251<sup>(3)</sup> temporary workers that appeared on both the Department's and A & Associate's lists. The results of this verification revealed that:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>(3)</sup> School Food Service does not have the social security numbers of the vendor's employees; however, the number is required for verification of the employees' background check status. As a result, the OIG submitted to School Police the information provided by the vendor.

- <u>One FSA from A & Associate had not been fingerprinted</u>. According to the Food Service Managers' Temporary Employee records for Fiscal Year 2018, this employee worked in 11 schools during 34 weeks for a total of 682.25 hours.
- <u>Two FSAs from A & Associate had been fingerprinted as vendors but their background checks expired on August 14, and November 1, 2017, respectively</u>. The first employee worked 26 hours in three schools for three weeks after the background check expired. The second employee worked 622.75 hours in one school during a 25-week period after the background check expired.

#### Recommendation

To protect the safety of our students, School Food Service Managers should verify that each temporary employee provided by A & Associate has a valid vendor badge since vendor badges issued by the School District Police Department have an expiration date. (Information for the above FSAs was provided to the Food Service Department for corrective action.)

#### Management's Response:

School Food Service: We have implemented the following corrective action: When a temporary services employee arrives at a school for the first time, the School Food Service Manager photo copies their badge and files it in a folder in their office. This ensures that each staff member has been verified that they have a valid District ID. Additionally, annually the School Food Service Field Specialists audit the school and the folder is checked to ensure procedures are being followed. We will be implementing a process (most likely through electronic tracking) that will also track expiration dates of staff badges and will alert us and the Temporary Services agency when the expiration date is getting close. (Please see page 10.)

#### OTHER DETERMINING VARIABLES: TEMPORARY EMPLOYEES FROM THE DISTRICT VERSUS THOSE FROM OUTSIDE PLACEMENT AGENCIES

There are other non-monetary determining variables for using District's temporary employees or substitute cafeteria workers from outside placement agencies. The following schedule shows the differences.

D.4	<u>Option 1</u> Using District	Option 2 Using Placement Outside Agency
Determining Variables	Temporary Employee	Temporary Worker
1. Operating Costs	More expensive due to higher hourly rates plus fringe benefits. Estimated \$4.0 million per year; i.e. 8% to 11% higher than the outside placement agency.	Less expensive due to lower hourly rates. Estimated \$3.6 million to \$3.7 million per year.

Ι	Determining Variables	Option 1 Using District Temporary Employee	<u>Option 2</u> Using Placement Outside Agency Temporary Worker
2.	Workforce Readily Available	Stable, better control for surprise for employee absenteeism.	May not meet the District's need.
3.	Technical/Skill Training to ensure Food Safety	Assurance of quality and experience of employees.	The District has to provide training for inexperienced outside workers – additional costs to the District.
4.	Compliance with Jessica Lunsford Act (Student Safety/Worker's Background Checks)	Assurance of employee background and clearance checks.	No guarantee.
5.	Recruitment, Administration and Training Costs	Administrative costs for recruitment and maintaining sufficient work force.	Administrative costs absorbed by outside agency.

#### FSAs STAFFING AT BROWARD AND MIAMI-DADE SCHOOL DISTRICTS

In February 2019, the OIG inquired about the food service operations and staffing arrangements at Broward County and Miami-Dade County School Districts.

<u>Broward County School District</u> indicated that they did not use an outside temp agency. Instead, they maintain an in-house substitute pool, consisting of 500 to 600 temporary employees. The list of substitutes is updated monthly and provided to each Food Service manager for use as needed.

<u>Miami-Dade County School District</u> indicated that they neither used an outside temp agency nor maintained a pool of in-house temp employees. They have a pool of seven potential Food Service managers-in-training that they can use to fill-in as needed. The pool can only go up to 20 people. Their school cafeterias do not have FSA positions by name. Each school cafeteria has a full-time manager and other part-time positions based on the needs of each school cafeteria. When a part-time employee is absent, the position may be filled with a manager-in-training or a part-time employee from another school, or the work-load can be shared by the existing workers who are present.

#### CONCLUSION

Our cost analysis for filling the 305 vacant FSA positions concluded that the estimated annual cost for using outside Temp FSAs was between \$3,630,415 and \$3,721,610; and the cost for using inhouse Temp FSAs was \$4,029,660. As a result, using outside temp would cost \$308,050 (8%) to \$399,245 (11%) less than the in-house temp.

However, there are other non-monetary determining factors for both options in addition to the cost consequence. The Food Service Department should consider these implications as well as their overall objectives and priorities in providing food services to our students and District employees. These determining variables include the workforce availability, technical skill and food safety training, workers' background checks, and the related administrative costs. The Department has to determine the optimal combination of staffing provided by temporary employees in meeting the ultimate goal.

#### Management's Response:

*School Food Service: School Food Service will continue to evaluate non-monetary and monetary factors when determining the use of temporary services. (Please see page 10.)* 

**Office of the CFO:** The School Food Service (SFS) department has historically done an excellent job managing their resources. The School District of Palm Beach County is fortunate the SFS operation is self-sufficient and requires no supplemental funding from the General Fund budget. The SFS department leadership is best equipped to make staffing decisions required to fulfill their mission and serve over 34.5 million meals each school year. (Please see page 11.)

- End of Report -

#### Management's Response School Food Service

SCHOOL DIG PALM BEACH COUNTY, FL	ALLISON MONBLEAU DIRECTOR	WANDA F. PAUL, M.ED., MB CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER
SCHOOL FOOD SERVICE DEPARTMENT 3661 INTERSTATE PARK ROAD NORTH, SUITE 100 RIVIERA BEACH, FL 33404	endergens occure Internet	
PHONE: 561-383-2000 / FAX: 561-383-2043 WWW.PALMBEACHSCHDOLS.ORG/SF5		
September 26, 2019		
To: Randy Law		
FROM: Allison Monbleau		
SUBJECT: Response to Special Review of Temporary Staff through June 2018	fing Costs in School Food Ser	vice For July 2105
Hello Mr. Law,		
I have reviewed the draft report of the information and fine Service. My response is below:	dings of the temporary staffir	ig costs in School Food
I agree with the the content of the review and the recommend	dation provided.	
Additionally, annually the School Food Service Field Sp to ensure procedures are being followed. We will be imp electronic tracking) that will also track expiration dates of Services agency when the expiration date is getting close 2. School Food Servcie will continue to evaluate non-mone use of temporary services.	plementing a process (most lil of staff badges and will alert u e.	kely through 15 and the Temoray
Please let me know if you need any additional information.	101	GROOM
Thank you.	K!	SEP 2 7 2019
allisin Mert	INSP	ECTOR GENERAL
Allison Monbleau	THOP.	OTON GENERAL
Director Palm Beach County School Food Service 561-383-2021 FA FDACS Agreement Number 50	XX 561-383-2043	

#### Management's Response *Office of the CFO*

CHOOL	THE SCHOOL DISTRICT OF PALM BEACH COUNTY, FL	MICHAEL J. BURKE CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER	DONALD E. FENNOY II, Ed SUPERINTENDENT
H O	CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICE 3300 FOREST HILL BOULIVARD, C-316 WEST PALM BEACH, FL 33406		
R HEADIG	PHONE: 561-434-8584 / Fax: 561-357-7585 WWW.PALMBEACHSCHOOLS.ORG/CFO		
Memo	randum	DF	CERVISIN
TO:	Lung Chiu, Inspector General	Ma	ICT - 8 2019
FROM:	Michael J. Burke, Chief Financial Offic	INSPEC	TOR GENERAL
DATE:	October 8, 2019		
SUBJECT:	Response to Special Review of Temp 2015 through June 2018	oorary Staffing Costs in S	chool Food Service for July
Managem the follow	ent reviewed the Report related to Temp ving response.	orary Staffing Costs in Sc	hool Food Service and has
Managem	ent Response:		
resources requires n	ol Food Service (SFS) department has h . The School District of Palm Beach County o supplemental funding from the General I to make staffing decisions required to ful ol year.	y is fortunate the SFS ope Fund budget. The SFS der	ration is self-sufficient and partment leadership is best
MJB:mw			
	anda Paul, Chief Operating Officer ison Monbleau, Director, School Food Serv	vice	